



# Value Matters™

THE COMPLIMENTARY NEWSLETTER FOR ATTORNEYS AND OTHER PROFESSIONAL ADVISORS TO BUSINESSES

Volume 2006-08 » August 28, 2006

[www.mercercapital.com](http://www.mercercapital.com)

[mcm@mercercapital.com](mailto:mcm@mercercapital.com)

## IRS Code Section 409A and Valuation

Under IRS Code Section 409A, options granted by companies must be valued at their fair market values on the date of their granting.

Prior to 409A, boards were able to establish option prices assuming they employed reasonable methods. Now, valuations can be conducted by companies as before; however, if the IRS determines, after-the-fact, that option exercise prices are below fair market value, the burden will be on the go-it-alone company to prove that its stock valuation method was reasonable.

Given the teeth of 409A (20% additional tax on the optionee, regular income taxes and employment taxes, and possibly interest charges), do-it-yourself the old way is not really a viable option. What, then, are the choices for valuing options in the new world of Section 409A?

According to 409A, there are three ways to obtain the "presumption of reasonableness" for your option valuations – not in order of appearance in the Code.

**Presumption 1 -- Binding Formula.** A valuation based on a binding formula used in a shareholder agreement would be considered to be fair market value if the stock is valued in the same manner for any other transfer of shares of the same or substantially similar class of stock. This would include all noncompensatory purposes requiring the stock to be valued -- including regulatory filings, loan covenants, issuances to and repurchases of stock from other than "service providers" (those receiving options).

*[Because of these restrictions, this option is not likely to be used frequently.]*

**Presumption 2 -- Illiquid Start-up Valuation.** A valuation made "reasonably and in good faith" of an illiquid, start-up company can enjoy the presumption of reasonableness if it meets certain requirements, including:

1. The valuation must be provided in a written report.
2. The valuation takes into account the "basic valuation factors" noted in 409A, which include:
  - a. The present value of expected future cash flows of the company.
  - b. The value of tangible and intangible assets of the corporation.

---

### INSIDE

---

#### PAGE TWO

Mercer Capital professionals achieved a 100% pass rate on this year's Chartered Financial Analyst exams, sponsored by the CFA Institute.

#### PAGE FIVE

Mercer Capital's Newest Book - *Buy-Sell Agreements: Ticking Time Bomb or Reasonable Resolution?*

#### PAGE SIX

Mercer Capital On the Road

---

- c. Comparisons with the stocks of reasonably similar publicly traded companies or comparisons with transactions involving similar companies.
  - d. Control premiums or marketability discounts.
  - e. Whether the valuation method is used for other purposes that have a material economic effect on the service recipient, its stockholders or its creditors.
  - f. Whether all relevant (material) information available to the company is considered in the valuation.
  - g. Whether the valuation has been updated to include consideration of information after the date of the calculation that could materially affect the value of the corporation.
  - h. The valuation must be less than 12 months old when used (assuming there have been no material changes in the interim).
  - i. Whether the valuation method is consistently used for other purposes, including noncompensatory purposes.
3. The valuation is performed by a person or persons at a company "with significant knowledge and experience or training in performing similar valuations." But which officers or directors of your company wants to try to convince the IRS on this point – when they are obviously not in the business of valuing companies and are obviously not independent with respect to your company?

A company can conduct a valuation for option purposes providing that it considers the factors above. If the IRS determines that any of the factors are not considered or fulfilled, it will not be treated as made "reasonably and in good faith." In so doing, it loses the presumption of reasonableness, and the burden of proving reasonableness shifts back to the company.

*[For these reasons, it is unlikely that many companies will opt for Presumption 2 and conduct their own valuations hoping to obtain the presumption of reasonableness.]*

**Presumption 3 – Independent Appraisal.** A valuation conducted by a qualified independent appraiser who uses accepted valuation methods and meets the basic requirements applicable to appraisals for employee stock ownership plans (ESOPs) will be presumed to be reasonable. It must, however, have been made within 12 months and must be updated if events subsequent to the appraisal date would have a material impact on the company's valuation.

*[Prudent boards and managements will undoubtedly default to Presumption 3, and will get formal appraisals from time-to-time to support their option pricing.]*

At this point, let me quote Brad Feld, a venture capitalist who writes a popular blog, *Feld Thoughts*. He writes, in one of many posts on 409A, "[So what's the big deal?](#)":

**“Cost.** On the high end these valuation can cost \$50,000 or so. [But don't let this frighten you yet ] Considering that the company must value options at every grant date, this can get incredibly expensive. We have some suggestions for how to solve this issue economically, but that's a later post (more foreshadowing).

---

## DID YOU KNOW ?

**Mercer Capital professionals achieved a 100% pass rate on this year's Chartered Financial Analyst exams, sponsored by the CFA Institute.**

*Level 3 – Conley W. Patton* passed the Level 3 exam, and is therefore entitled to use the CFA designation.

*Level 2 – B. Tyler Beckman, Eden A. Gipson, Lucas M. Parris and Jay D. Wilson, Jr.*

*Level 1 – Kristin P. Cicala, Brooks K. Hamner, Laura J. Hoffmeister, and B. Patrick Lynch*

The CFA charter is a globally recognized standard of expertise in investment analysis and portfolio management. Over 84,000 candidates around the world sat for the three levels of the charter tests this year.

“This is a capable bunch, so I'm not surprised,” noted Matt Crow, ASA, CFA and a senior vice president at Mercer Capital. “But I am proud that these outstandingly talented folks got us a 100% pass rate when the overall pass rate this year was 48%.”

**Competency.** Not wanting to be left out of the "entrepreneurial spirit of Silicon Valley," smaller valuation companies are popping up all over the map to perform these valuations at substantial discounts to the established players. The problem is that few firms (and very few people) have a great deal of history or experience in valuing private companies, so the verdict is out whether these reports will be acceptable to the IRS should they come knocking. We are getting multiple calls a day from people wanting to perform valuations and most of them we wouldn't trust to give us change back from a cash register. (As an aside, one of our companies recently completed a formal valuation and the valuation firm (presumably a reputable one) forgot to take into account liquidation preferences of the preferred stock when considering common stock payouts on mergers. Once they did this, it reduced their initial valuation by 75%. Oops.)

**History.** The "grandfather clause" for 409A only applies to options that have vested by 12/31/04. As a result, any option that is still unvested (or granted) after 12/31/04 has to be "fixed" (yes – another post). Therefore, if you are a typical private company that has four year vesting on stock options, you've got to fix option grants that go back as far as 2001. Groovy.

**Uncertainty.** The big question that everyone is grappling with is what will the results be from these formal valuations? Will they be 10 times higher? Could they even be lower? No one really know the real impact of the valuations, because no one really knows how these firms will value the companies. We've seen a couple reports so far and in one case the price was actually lower than the company was granting at, while the other company was significantly higher. Uncertainty, however breeds nervous people."

**Who can you turn to?** Start-ups and venture based companies, as well as private equity groups doing deals where options are issued will have an increasing need for independent appraisal of their stocks' values.

While, as Brad Feld points out, smaller valuation companies may be "popping up all over the map" to do 409A valuations, there are a number of long-established appraisal firms (like Mercer Capital, of course) that are more likely to provide satisfactory, long-term results. They have, for example:

1. Experience in the valuation of private companies, having completed thousands of appraisals over many years.
2. Staffs to handle time-sensitive and complex assignments -- and companies with multiple rounds of financing definitely have complex capital structures that must be addressed with credibility.
3. Since many 409A valuations will be used directly, or with some modification, for financial reporting purposes, the established firms will be familiar with the technical aspects of required reviews by your auditors. See the [\*AICPA Practice Aid, Valuation of Privately-Held Company Equity Securities Issued as Compensation\*](#). This raises an issue of the fair market value for purposes of the Internal Revenue Service versus fair value for financial reporting purposes, which will be the subject of a future post.
4. Most of the established firms will have professionals who have substantial experience in dealing with the IRS to resolve valuation issues. Their histories of successfully resolving issues should provide comfort to companies.
5. The established valuation firms should also have quality control and review procedures in place that help assure the quality, consistency and acceptability of their work products.

---

## RESOURCES

---

For other articles of interest, visit Mercer Capital's Library of Articles at [www.mercercapital.com](http://www.mercercapital.com).

---

**In conclusion.** Selection of established and experienced firms to provide valuations for 409A purposes need not be as expensive as Brad Feld's concern -- at least in the great majority of situations. It is, after all, a competitive world. What you need to find is a workable combination of price and quality to meet your needs. You should not, however, have to sacrifice quality in meeting your 409A valuation requirements.



**Z. Christopher Mercer ASA, CFA**  
mercerc@mercercapital.com

#### **Other 409A Resources from Mercer Capital**

- » "Section 409A of the Internal Revenue Service Code," Z. Christopher Mercer, *Mercer on Value*, June 20, 2006
- » "8 Things You Should Know about 409A," Travis W. Harms, *Value Matters™*, June 8, 2006
- » "Pricing Stock Options – IRS Code Section 409A," Z. Christopher Mercer, *Mercer on Value*, May 16, 2006
- » "Watch Out for 409A," Eden A. Gipson, *Value Matters™*, February 16, 2006

*This article originally appeared as a post on Mercer on Value on August 23, 2006.*

*See [www.merceronvalue.com](http://www.merceronvalue.com) for other 409A information.*

RESERVE YOUR COPY OF MERCER CAPITAL'S NEWEST BOOK



## BUY - SELL AGREEMENTS

TICKING TIME BOMB OR REASONABLE RESOLUTION?

Coming Winter 2006

**Does your or your clients' buy-sell agreement say what you think it says? You might be surprised.**

In this book, we speak from our own experiences valuing hundreds of buy-sell agreements. You will gain insight into the folly of fixed-price or formula pricing, the different appraisal mechanisms, common misunderstandings that can end up as big money issues, and the pitfalls of buy-sell templates. This information can save you or your clients thousands, if not hundreds of thousands, of dollars and years of frustration dealing with buy-sell agreements that, in the end, don't say what you think they say! If you are an attorney, CPA, insurance provider, business owner, or a business appraiser, you have to have this book.

A PRE-PUBLICATION DISCOUNT OF 25%

# \$59

To reserve your copy at the pre-publication discount visit our pre-publication website, [www.mercercapital.com/products/buysellbook.htm](http://www.mercercapital.com/products/buysellbook.htm) And enter the reservation code **VM0806**

Note: Shortly before the book is published, you will receive an invoice with the special pre-publication discount. You are under no obligation to purchase. Upon publication, the book will be sent to you. If you are not satisfied with the book, return it for a 100% refund.

ANNOUNCING MERCER CAPITAL'S E-BOOK LIBRARY

Title	Description	Investment	Release Date
<b>Valuing Shareholder Cash Flows: Quantifying Marketability Discounts</b>	<i>Quantifying Marketability Discounts</i> has been updated and is now offered as an e-book. Titled <i>Verifying Shareholder Cash Flows: Quantifying Marketability Discounts - 2005 E-Book</i> , this edition provides a brand new chapter which discusses each of the five assumptions of the QMDM in depth. As a bonus, when you purchase the e-book, you will also receive the <i>QMDM Companion</i> , the latest edition of the Quantitative Marketability Discount Model in spreadsheet format. We plan to continually add content to this e-book, and as a purchaser, you will receive this content free-of-charge when it becomes available.	<b>\$95.00</b>	<i>Currently Available</i>
<b>Valuing Financial Institutions</b>	We are responding to requests to put this book back into print and we are doing so as an e-book	<b>\$65.00</b>	<i>Currently Available</i>
<b>Valuation for Impairment Testing</b>	The first SFAS 142 valuation resource for CFOs and auditors. Also available in printed form at <a href="http://www.mercercapital.com">www.mercercapital.com</a>	<b>\$45.00</b>	<i>Currently Available</i>
<b>Are S Corporations Worth More Than C Corporations?</b>	An e-booklet that adds to the S Corp vs. C Corp. debate	<b>Complimentary</b>	<i>Currently Available</i>
<b>Embedded Capital Gains</b>	An examination of the Embedded Capital Gains issue through 2005	<b>\$19.95</b>	<i>Currently Available</i>
<b>Rate &amp; Flow: An Alternative Approach to Determining Active/Passive Appreciation in Marital Dissolutions</b>	In this e-book, we present an alternative model for determining active / passive appreciation in a marital dissolution. In states where an owner/spouse's active management of a business does not preclude the consideration of passive appreciation we offer a fresh approach based on rate and flow analysis	<b>Complimentary</b>	<i>Currently Available</i>

Visit our website at [www.mercercapital.com](http://www.mercercapital.com) for more information or to download an e-book.

**August 31, 2006**

"Adjusting Multiples from Guideline Public Companies"  
 BV Resources Teleconference  
 To register, visit [www.bvresources.com](http://www.bvresources.com)

**Timothy R. Lee, ASA, panelist**

**September 12, 2006**

FCG Fall Conference  
 Phoenix, Arizona  
 "IPO Studies v. Restricted Stock Studies v. QMDM -  
 What's an Analyst To Do?"

**Travis W. Harms, CPA/ABV, CFA**

**September 18, 2006**

"Buy - Sell Agreements:  
 Ticking Time Bomb or Reasonable Resolution?"  
 Virginia Society of CPA's 7th Annual  
 Business Valuation, Fraud and  
 Litigation Services Conference  
 Richmond, Virginia

**Z. Christopher Mercer, ASA, CFA**

**October 19-20, 2006**

"Today's Word on Lack of Marketability"  
 CICBV/ASA Annual Conference  
 Toronto, Canada

**Z. Christopher Mercer, ASA, CFA**

**November 6, 2006**

"Marketing with the Newest Technology Tools"  
 IGAF Conference  
 Las Vegas, Nevada

**Barbara Walters Price**

**November 30 - December 1, 2006**

Topic TBD  
 Arkansas AICPA Meeting  
 Little Rock, Arkansas

**Timothy R. Lee, ASA**

**December 3-4, 2006**

"Buy - Sell Agreements: Ticking Time-Bomb or  
 Reasonable Resolution?"  
 "Ask the Experts Panel"  
 AICPA Business Valuation  
 Conference  
 Austin, Texas

**Z. Christopher Mercer, ASA, CFA**

The professionals of Mercer Capital have a great deal of experience speaking to industry and professional groups across the nation on topics such as:

- » Buy-Sell Agreements
- » The Integrated Theory of Business Valuation
- » Is Your Business Ready for Sale?<sup>TM</sup>
- » Purchase Price Allocation
- » Valuation of Employee Stock Options
- » Litigation Support and Expert Testimony
- » Valuation of Privately Held Businesses, Partnerships, or LLCs
- » Financial Institution Valuation
- » ESOP Valuation

**To book a Mercer Capital professional as a speaker at your next conference or CLE/CPE meeting, please contact Barbara Walters Price at [priceb@mercercapital.com](mailto:priceb@mercercapital.com).**

## A GENTLE PLUG FOR OUR FIRM

**MERCER CAPITAL** is a business valuation and investment banking firm serving a national and international clientele. Our reputation for excellence is based on an ability to solve complex financial problems expeditiously. We convert over 20 years of experience, including thousands of assignments, into solutions for the issues of today.

**Corporate Valuation.** Mercer Capital provides a broad range of independent valuation and financial advisory services, including:

- » Dispute Analysis Services and Expert Testimony
- » Valuation for Corporate Tax Matters
- » Valuation for Corporate Income Tax Issues
- » Valuation for ESOPs
- » Purchase Price Allocations
- » Valuation of Employee Options
- » Goodwill Impairment Testing
- » Valuation of Intangible Assets
- » Fairness Opinions

**Investment Banking.** Mercer Capital's investment banking division specializes in providing merger and acquisition services to sellers or buyers of private businesses or public companies divesting divisions and subsidiaries. In addition, we assist clients in industry consolidations, roll ups, and refinancings.

## INTERNET COMMERCE: OBTAIN PROPOSALS TO VALUE YOUR COMPANY, BANK, FLP OR LLC VIA OUR WEBSITE

The cost of your time and delays in obtaining proposals has just gone down. Use one of the PROPOSAL REQUEST FORMS on our website.

Many of your colleagues have already used our PROPOSAL REQUEST FORMS and are impressed by the decrease in transactional overhead and the increased ease in obtaining actionable proposals for their clients. We are pleased to be doing business with them. Try it yourself. Visit our website and provide us with the pertinent information via this form, and we'll prepare a proposal and deliver it to you via e-mail, fax or USPS. Complete confidentiality is assured.

## UNSUBSCRIBE

We will continue to send the newsletter as published at no cost unless you notify us that you wish to be removed from the distribution list. To REMOVE yourself from this list, send an e-mail to: [mercercapital@mercercapital.com](mailto:mercercapital@mercercapital.com) and type the words "Unsubscribe – Value Matters" in the subject line (without the quotation marks).



Business Valuation • Investment Banking

Headquarters:  
5860 Ridgeway Center Parkway, Suite 400  
Memphis, Tennessee 38120  
901.685.2120 » Fax 901.685.2199

Louisville Office:  
511 South 5th Street, Suite 206  
Louisville, Kentucky 40202  
502.585.6340 » Fax 502.585.6345

[www.mercercapital.com](http://www.mercercapital.com)

DISCLAIMER. This publication does not constitute legal, valuation, tax, or financial consulting advice. It is offered as an information service to our clients and friends. Those interested in specific guidance for legal and accounting matters should seek competent professional advice. Inquiries to discuss specific valuation or corporate finance matters are welcomed. Permission is specifically granted to send copies of this Value Matters™ to others who might have an interest in its contents. Permission is also granted to quote portions of this newsletter with proper attribution.

Copyright © 2006 by Mercer Capital Management, Inc., all rights reserved. Text, graphics, and HTML code are protected by US and International Copyright Laws, and may not be copied, reprinted, published, translated, hosted, or otherwise distributed by any means without explicit permission.