Focus on IRS Section 409a

Not All Classes of Equity Were Created Equal

IRS Section 409A requires that companies issuing stock options (or stock appreciation rights) determine the fair market value of the underlying shares at each grant date. Compliance with Section 409A may be particularly troublesome for start-up companies in various stages of corporate development. Such companies frequently grant options, and are often capitalized with several classes of preferred and common equity securities with differing associated economic and control rights. While the presence of several classes of equity can prove vexing when valuing the individual securities, valuation professionals have developed methods to tackle these problems, three of which are discussed in the AICPA Practice Aid: Valuation of Privately-Held-Company Equity Securities Issued as Compensation.

Due to the substantial risk that is often involved in investing in early-stage startup companies, investors often demand higher returns and greater corporate influence. As a startup company matures, capital needs tend to increase while the perceived risk often decreases, leading to multiple rounds of financing (generally structured as preferred equity). A thorough understanding of the different rights associated with the various classes of equity is necessary to properly allocate a company’s value between the different equity securities.

The rights pertaining to different classes of preferred or common equity can be generally categorized as economic rights or control rights. Basically, economic rights are intended to provide economic protections and preferences relative to lower classes of equity, while control rights are designed to provide discretion and influence with respect to significant corporate decisions. Typical economic rights include preferred dividends, liquidation preferences, mandatory redemption rights, and conversion rights, among others. Typical control rights include voting rights, veto rights, board composition, and first refusal rights, among others.

To illustrate, consider an equity capital structure with three classes of equity: common stock (10 million shares), Preferred Series A (10 million shares), and Preferred Series B (20 million shares). Assume that Series A is senior to Series B, both carry a $1 liquidation preference, and Series B carries conversion rights at $1 per share. As shown in the payoff diagram below (which describes the liquidation value of...
each equity class based on total equity value), Series A, being senior to both common stock and Series B, increases in value up until total equity value reaches the total liquidation preference of $10 million (10 million shares at $1 / share). Series B, being senior to only common stock, increases in value until total equity value reaches $30 million (the combined total liquidation preference of both series of preferred stock). It is not until the total liquidation preference of all preferred stock is met that common stock would receive any payout at the time of a liquidation event. When the common stock value reaches $1 per share (total equity value of $40 million), Series B would exercise its conversion rights and share in further appreciation on a pro rata basis with the common shareholders.

The **AICPA Practice Aid** discusses three methods of allocating enterprise value across various equity classes in a company: the probability-weighted expected return method (“PWERM”), the option-pricing method (“OPM”), and the current-value method (“CVM”). The Practice Aid also clearly states that “no single enterprise value allocation method appears to be superior in all respects and in all circumstances over the others.”

Under the PWERM, the company’s enterprise value is estimated at the date of various assumed potential future outcomes (which could include an IPO, liquidation, continued private operation, etc.). Each enterprise value is allocated across the different classes of equity based on the rights and characteristics of each equity class assuming the equity-holders maximize the value of investments (i.e. holders of convertible preferred stock convert when appropriate, etc.). Each estimated scenario value is then discounted to the present at an appropriate rate and probability weighted to determine the fair market value of each class of securities. This method is conceptually appealing in its forward-looking consideration of different liquidity events; however, at the same time, it is heavily reliant on assumptions (indications of value are only as good as the assumptions on which they stand) and certain circumstances can require very complex probability modeling.

**DID YOU KNOW?**

*Mercer Capital’s Bank Watch*, a monthly publication, is being reintroduced at the request of our clients and referral sources.

Delivered via e-mail, we have expanded the publication to include public market indicators such as the Southeast Bank Group Index, as well as M&A market indicators. Covering eight states, Alabama, Arkansas, Georgia, Kentucky, Louisiana, Mississippi, Missouri, and Tennessee, we follow and discuss recent transactions. And, of course, Mercer Capital’s Southeast Bank Group is included. If you are a banker or advise bankers, you cannot be without this complimentary publication.

To receive a complimentary subscription to *Mercer Capital’s Bank Watch*, just provide us your e-mail address by visiting www.mercercapital.com. If you would prefer to receive a hard copy, the cost is $99 per year for twelve issues.
The OPM considers the various classes of equity as a group of call options on the company’s total enterprise value. Under this method, exercise prices reflect the respective liquidation preferences and conversion rights of each class of preferred stock. In the case of the example capital structure we discussed previously, Series A would be modeled as a call option with an exercise price of zero, Series B with an exercise price of $10 million. Common stock is modeled as a call option with an exercise price equal to the enterprise value of the company remaining after each class of preferred stock has been liquidated (or $30 million in the case of the example above). Conversion features, such as those accruing to Series A, may also be modeled in an option-pricing method. Although somewhat less intuitive, the OPM is attractive in that it does not require as many assumptions as the PWERM, while still considering differences in equity classes from a forward-looking perspective. On the other hand, the method requires an assumption of volatility which can be difficult to accurately estimate for a private company.

The CVM values each equity class based on the greater of conversion value or liquidation preference in the context of the company’s current enterprise value (as determined through an appropriate application of traditional valuation approaches). The simplicity and clarity of the CVM can make it an appealing method to use in certain circumstances; however, this method does not consider value from a forward-looking perspective. Despite this shortcoming, this method can be useful in situations where a liquidity event appears imminent or where the company is at an early stage of development such that predictions of future performance are highly speculative.

Even in relatively simple circumstances where a company is capitalized by only two or three classes of equity, judgment related to the appropriate method and assumptions must be exercised based on the subject company’s stage of development, industry, expectational factors, and any other material factor that could impact value. In cases where the capital structure is not so simple as only two or three classes of equity, the valuation models can become substantially more complex. Given the high stakes of IRS Section 409A compliance, it is important to choose a valuation professional with industry knowledge, familiarity with IRS and FASB standards, and experience tackling complex valuation issues through a variety of methods. The professionals at Mercer Capital have this experience and expertise, and are available to talk with you about any valuation issues related to equity securities in complex capital structures.
Does your or your clients' buy-sell agreement say what you think it says? You might be surprised.

In this book, we speak from our own experiences valuing hundreds of buy-sell agreements. You will gain insight into the folly of fixed-price or formula pricing, the different appraisal mechanisms, common misunderstandings that can end up as big money issues, and the pitfalls of buy-sell templates. This information can save you or your clients thousands, if not hundreds of thousands, of dollars and years of frustration dealing with buy-sell agreements that, in the end, don’t say what you think they say! If you are an attorney, CPA, insurance provider, business owner, or a business appraiser, you have to have this book.

Note: Shortly before the book is published, you will receive an invoice with the special pre-publication discount. You are under no obligation to purchase. Upon publication, the book will be sent to you. If you are not satisfied with the book, return it for a 100% refund.

---

**Announcing Mercer Capital’s E-Book Library**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Investment</th>
<th>Release Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valuing Shareholder Cash Flows: Quantifying Marketability Discounts</td>
<td>Quantifying Marketability Discounts has been updated and is now offered as an e-book. Titled Verifying Shareholder Cash Flows: Quantifying Marketability Discounts - 2005 E-Book, this edition provides a brand new chapter which discusses each of the five assumptions of the QMDM in depth. As a bonus, when you purchase the e-book, you will also receive the GMDM Companion, the latest edition of the Quantitative Marketability Discount Model in spreadsheet format. We plan to continually add content to this e-book, and as a purchaser, you will receive this content free-of-charge when it becomes available.</td>
<td>$95.00</td>
<td>Currently Available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Valuing Financial Institutions</td>
<td>We are responding to requests to put this book back into print and we are doing so as an e-book</td>
<td>$65.00</td>
<td>Currently Available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Valuation for Impairment Testing</td>
<td>The first SFAS 142 valuation resource for CFOs and auditors. Also available in printed form at <a href="http://www.mercercapital.com">www.mercercapital.com</a></td>
<td>$45.00</td>
<td>Currently Available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are S Corporations Worth More Than C Corporations?</td>
<td>An e-booklet that adds to the S Corp vs. C Corp. debate</td>
<td>Complimentary</td>
<td>Currently Available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Embedded Capital Gains</td>
<td>An examination of the Embedded Capital Gains issue through 2005</td>
<td>$19.95</td>
<td>Currently Available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rate &amp; Flow: An Alternative Approach to Determining Active/Passive Appreciation in Marital Dissolutions</td>
<td>In this e-book, we present an alternative model for determining active / passive appreciation in a marital dissolution. In states where an owner/spouse’s active management of a business does not preclude the consideration of passive appreciation we offer a fresh approach based on rate and flow analysis</td>
<td>Complimentary</td>
<td>Currently Available</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Visit our website at www.mercercapital.com for more information or to download an e-book.
The professionals of Mercer Capital have a great deal of experience speaking to industry and professional groups across the nation on topics such as:

- Buy-Sell Agreements
- The Integrated Theory of Business Valuation
- Is Your Business Ready for Sale™
- Purchase Price Allocation
- Valuation of Employee Stock Options
- Litigation Support and Expert Testimony
- Valuation of Privately Held Businesses, Partnerships, or LLCs
- Financial Institution Valuation
- ESOP Valuation

To book a Mercer Capital professional as a speaker at your next conference or CLE/CPE meeting, please contact Barbara Walters Price at priceb@mercercapital.com.
A GENTLE PLUG FOR OUR FIRM

**MERCER CAPITAL** is a business valuation and investment banking firm serving a national and international clientele. Our reputation for excellence is based on an ability to solve complex financial problems expeditiously. We convert over 20 years of experience, including thousands of assignments, into solutions for the issues of today.

**Corporate Valuation.** Mercer Capital provides a broad range of independent valuation and financial advisory services, including:

- Dispute Analysis Services and Expert Testimony
- Valuation for Corporate Tax Matters
- Valuation for Corporate Income Tax Issues
- Valuation for ESOPs
- Purchase Price Allocations
- Valuation of Employee Options
- Goodwill Impairment Testing
- Valuation of Intangible Assets
- Fairness Opinions

**Investment Banking.** Mercer Capital's investment banking division and specializes in providing merger and acquisition services to sellers or buyers of private businesses or public companies divesting divisions and subsidiaries. In addition, we assist clients in industry consolidations, roll ups, and refinancings.

INTERNET COMMERCE: OBTAIN PROPOSALS TO VALUE YOUR COMPANY, BANK, FLP OR LLC VIA OUR WEBSITE

The cost of your time and delays in obtaining proposals has just gone down. Use one of the PROPOSAL REQUEST FORMS on our website.

Many of your colleagues have already used our PROPOSAL REQUEST FORMS and are impressed by the decrease in transactional overhead and the increased ease in obtaining actionable proposals for their clients. We are pleased to be doing business with them. Try it yourself! Visit our website and provide us with the pertinent information via this form, and we'll prepare a proposal and deliver it to you via e-mail, fax or USPS. Complete confidentiality is assured.

UNSUBSCRIBE

We will continue to send the newsletter as published at no cost unless you notify us that you wish to be removed from the distribution list. To REMOVE yourself from this list, send an e-mail to: mercer-owner@mercercapital.com and type the words "Unsubscribe – Value Matters" in the subject line (without the quotation marks).

DISCLAIMER. This publication does not constitute legal, valuation, tax, or financial consulting advice. It is offered as an information service to our clients and friends. Those interested in specific guidance for legal and accounting matters should seek competent professional advice. Inquiries to discuss specific valuation or corporate finance matters are welcomed. Permission is specifically granted to send copies of this Value Matters™ to others who might have an interest in its contents. Permission is also granted to quote portions of this newsletter with proper attribution.